NAMA Journal of International Education and Development, 1:1 (JUN 2024) 25-48
ISSN: 2948-3638

A Preliminary Comparison of Leadership Practices at Select Educational NGOs in Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan: Probing into Challenges and Possibilities

Jafar Paramboor [1] and Ahmad Kamal Effendi Kamarudin[2]

ABSTRACT

The present paper delves into the landscape of leadership practices at educational NGOs within the contexts of three countries. Specifically, the aim of this scholarly investigation is to identify the existing practices in leadership at selected NGO institutions working for educational empowerment in these three countries and highlight the limitations as well as the possibilities of leadership across the institutions. The paper also looks into how the leadership is contextualized in these areas, by critically analyzing and comparing the three leadership contexts. Data were obtained from those in leadership positions at 14 NGOs in Indonesia, seven NGOs from Kyrgyzstan, and 16 NGOs from Tanzania. Various strategies were employed including interviews, survey instruments, observations, and standardized assessment tool kits prepared by the NAMA Foundation. The collected data is filtered and scrutinized through qualitative data analysis techniques, including thematizing the responses and later relating all the available themes to the relevant leadership theories. This helped in identifying the multi-faceted challenges in the prevailing practices at the educational NGOs of these three countries. The findings of this study have revealed the complex interplay between the NGO leadership, organizational outcomes, and the effectiveness of their educational endeavors.

Keywords: *educational leadership, leadership practices, NGO, leadership challenges, leadership domain, Indonesia, Kyrgyzstan, Tanzania*

[1] Department of Social Foundation & Educational Leadership Kulliyyah of Education, IIUM
[2] Postgraduate Candidate, Kulliyyah of Education, IIUM,
*Corresponding Author: pjafar@iium.edu.my

INTRODUCTION

Leadership within educational Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) is pivotal in navigating the complex and dynamic landscapes of global education. These organizations, operating outside governmental frameworks, are instrumental in mitigating educational disparities, enhancing access to quality education, and fostering sustainable development across diverse socio-cultural and geopolitical settings (Kolleck, 2018; Berkovich & Foldes, 2012; Eyal & Yarm, 2018; Yemini, Cegla, & Sagie, 2018). The effectiveness of educational NGOs significantly hinges on the leadership practices embedded within their structures, which directly influence their capacity to act as change agents in the education sector (Gali & Schechter, 2020; Hallinger, 2018). Recognizing the vital role of leadership, the CSO Lead programme, initiated by the NAMA Foundation, aims to enhance the leadership competencies of educational NGOs, thereby augmenting their organizational outcomes and the efficacy of their educational initiatives (Ehrlich, 2022; James, Connolly, & Hawkins, 2020).

Despite the pivotal role of leadership in educational NGOs, various challenges and opportunities distinctly present themselves across the different contexts of Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan. In Indonesia, leadership practices face the challenge of adapting to rapid socio-economic changes while capitalizing on the opportunity to innovate educational strategies for diverse populations (Mujiburrahman, 2016). Tanzanian NGOs encounter hurdles in leadership development amidst striving to enhance educational quality in under-resourced areas, highlighting the need for tailored leadership training programmes (Komba, 2019). Conversely, Kyrgyzstan presents a unique landscape where educational NGOs navigate through governance and financial sustainability challenges, albeit with significant opportunities to leverage community engagement for impactful educational initiatives (UNESCO, 2018).

Following the comprehensive background laid out on the critical role of leadership within educational NGOs, the study delves into a nuanced exploration of the specific challenges and opportunities characterizing leadership practices across NGOs in Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan. These nations, distinct in their socio-cultural and geopolitical fabrics, present unique leadership dynamics within their educational NGOs. The leadership challenges in these contexts are multifaceted, ranging from adapting to cultural nuances, navigating varied governance structures, to fostering human capital development and ensuring financial sustainability. These challenges underscore the necessity for adaptive and innovative leadership approaches to enhance the NGOs' impact on educational disparities.

Simultaneously, these challenges are juxtaposed with opportunities for significant leadership enhancement. For instance, the

variability in organizational governance and human capital development across these regions suggests potential avenues for leadership practices to evolve towards more inclusive, adaptive, and strategic frameworks. This evolution is particularly crucial in light of the global educational landscape's increasing complexity, where leadership effectiveness directly influences NGOs' capacity to mitigate educational disparities and foster sustainable development.

Thus, the study aims to not only identify and analyze these prevailing leadership practices within the educational NGOs of Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan but also to uncover the underlying challenges and harness potential opportunities for leadership improvement. Through this lens, the study seeks to contribute to the broader discourse on educational NGO leadership, providing strategic insights that could inform the development of more nuanced, context-aware leadership development initiatives, particularly under the auspices of the CSO Lead programme. This investigation aligns with the findings of Ehrlich (2022) and Gali and Schechter (2020), emphasizing the profound impact of contextualized leadership development on organizational outcomes and the efficacy of educational endeavors.

Significance of the Study

Building upon the identified objectives and challenges in leadership practices across educational NGOs in Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan, the significance of this study emerges as a cornerstone for both theoretical understanding and practical application in leadership development within the NGO sector. The study's findings offer profound implications for educational NGOs, shedding light on the nuanced dynamics of leadership that directly impact organizational effectiveness and the delivery of educational services in varying socio-cultural and geopolitical contexts.

The potential impact of this research is multi-faceted, offering a lens through which leadership practices can be reevaluated and enhanced to better serve the educational communities within these regions. Firstly, by delineating the specific challenges and opportunities within each country's NGO leadership practices, the study paves the way for tailored leadership development programmes that are sensitive to the unique needs and circumstances of each context. This approach aligns with the ethos of the CSO Lead programme, emphasizing the importance of contextualized leadership development initiatives (Ehrlich, 2022; Gali & Schechter, 2020).

Furthermore, the findings underscore the critical role of adaptive leadership in navigating the complex landscape of global education, where leadership practices must evolve in response to both internal organizational needs and external environmental pressures. This resonates with the call for transformative leadership practices that are capable of

fostering organizational resilience and enhancing the educational impact of NGOs (James, Connolly, & Hawkins, 2020; Okoth, 2018). Moreover, the study contributes to the broader discourse on educational leadership by highlighting the interconnectedness between leadership practices and organizational outcomes within the NGO sector. This is particularly significant in light of the increasing reliance on NGOs to mitigate educational disparities and promote equitable access to quality education globally. As such, the insights garnered from this research have the potential to inform policy-making, strategic planning, and capacity-building efforts aimed at strengthening the leadership capabilities of educational NGOs.

In sum, the significance of this study lies in its capacity to inform and inspire a reimagined approach to leadership within educational NGOs, advocating for a more nuanced, contextualized, and adaptive leadership model that can navigate the complexities of global education challenges. Through this lens, the study not only contributes to academic knowledge but also offers practical implications for leadership development programmes, ultimately aiming to enhance the efficacy and impact of educational NGOs in Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan.

The Questions Addressed

Following the elucidation of the study's significance, a natural progression leads us to contemplate the precise questions that this investigation seeks to address. These queries are aimed at dissecting the multifaceted dynamics of leadership within educational NGOs across Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan, thereby facilitating a deeper understanding of the challenges and opportunities that pervade leadership practices in these diverse contexts.

Central to this exploration is the inquiry into how leadership practices within educational NGOs are conceptualized and operationalized across the distinct socio-cultural and geopolitical landscapes of Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan. This question seeks to unearth the contextual nuances that influence leadership styles and strategies, thereby contributing to the broader discourse on adaptive and context-sensitive leadership in the field of global education. Additionally, the study endeavors to unravel the specific challenges that impede the effectiveness of leadership within these NGOs. This inquiry is pivotal in identifying the barriers to leadership efficacy, thus enabling targeted interventions aimed at mitigating these challenges and enhancing leadership capacity within these organizations. Moreover, this research probes into the opportunities that exist for enhancing leadership practices within educational NGOs in these countries. This question is instrumental in highlighting the potential pathways for leadership development, thereby fostering more robust and impactful educational initiatives that can navigate the complexities of the global educational landscape. Lastly, the

study examines the implications of the identified leadership practices, challenges, and opportunities for the broader realm of educational NGO management and leadership development. This inquiry aims to synthesize the insights garnered from the research into actionable strategies for leadership enhancement, thereby contributing to the ongoing efforts to bolster educational outcomes through effective NGO leadership.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The crux of this analysis lies in dissecting various leadership theories that underscore the dynamics within NGOs. Among these, Transformational Leadership theory posits that leaders can inspire followers to change expectations, perceptions, and motivations to work towards common goals. This theory, as expounded by Burns (1978) and further elaborated by Bass (1985), is particularly relevant to NGOs, where leadership is often about inspiring volunteers and staff towards a shared vision for change. Additionally, the Situational Leadership theory, proposed by Hersey and Blanchard (1969), suggests that the most successful leaders are those who can adapt their leadership style to the maturity of the followers they are trying to influence. This adaptability is crucial in the context of NGOs operating across diverse cultural and geopolitical landscapes. Moreover, the concept of Servant Leadership, introduced by Greenleaf (1977), where the primary goal of the leader is to serve, is especially pertinent to the ethos of NGOs. This approach aligns with the intrinsic values of educational NGOs, emphasizing the importance of meeting the needs of others and empowering communities to develop and grow. These theories collectively provide a robust framework for understanding the complex leadership dynamics within NGOs. They highlight the necessity for leaders in educational NGOs to not only be adaptable and transformative but also to place a significant emphasis on serving their communities and fostering a collective sense of purpose and direction. The relevance of these theoretical perspectives is underscored by their applicability across the varied contexts of Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan. Each country presents unique challenges and opportunities for educational NGOs, from cultural and social nuances to economic and political constraints. As such, the theoretical framework offers a lens through which to examine how leadership practices can be optimized to navigate these diverse settings effectively.

Building on the theoretical underpinnings of leadership within the context of NGOs, it becomes imperative to delve into empirical studies that shed light on the intersection of leadership practices and their impact on educational outcomes. This exploration is not only essential for understanding the practical applications of leadership theories but also for identifying the unique challenges and opportunities that emerge within the sphere of educational NGOs. A plethora of studies have demonstrated the pivotal role of leadership in influencing the effectiveness and

sustainability of NGOs. For instance, Gali and Schechter (2020) illuminate how leadership practices within NGOs directly contribute to educational policy and practice, emphasizing the transformative potential of leadership in shaping educational landscapes. Similarly, Ehrlich's (2022) examination of leadership development initiatives underscores the significance of strategic leadership in fostering organizational resilience and enhancing educational initiatives. These empirical insights are crucial in understanding how leadership practices are operationalized within NGOs and the resultant impact on educational outcomes. Furthermore, research conducted by James, Connolly, and Hawkins (2020) on redefining educational leadership practice offers a nuanced perspective on the complexities of leading educational NGOs. Their study highlights the importance of adaptive and inclusive leadership styles in navigating the multifaceted challenges faced by NGOs in diverse socio-cultural contexts. This body of empirical evidence serves as a testament to the critical role of leadership in driving positive educational outcomes, particularly within the challenging and dynamic environments in which NGOs operate.

This study, through its in-depth examination of leadership practices within educational NGOs across Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan, contributes significantly to the literature on NGO leadership, particularly within the educational sector. Despite a rich array of studies on leadership within NGOs, a focused analysis comparing leadership practices and their impact on educational outcomes across diverse geopolitical and socio-cultural contexts remains sparse. This research endeavors to fill this lacuna by offering a comparative analysis that not only elucidates the specific leadership practices prevalent in educational NGOs across the three studied countries but also scrutinizes the challenges and opportunities these practices present within the unique context of each nation. By doing so, the study broadens the understanding of how leadership practices are influenced by and adapt to different cultural, economic, and social environments, an area that remains underexplored in existing research. Moreover, this study contributes to the literature by linking leadership practices directly to organizational outcomes and effectiveness within the realm of education. While previous studies have emphasized the importance of leadership in achieving organizational goals, there remains a gap in understanding how these leadership practices specifically impact the educational initiatives and outcomes of NGOs. This research addresses this gap by providing insights into how leadership practices influence the effectiveness of educational endeavors, thereby contributing to the ongoing discourse on the role of NGOs in global education.

In essence, this study not only enriches the academic understanding of NGO leadership practices but also provides practical implications for enhancing leadership within the sector, particularly in the context of educational NGOs. It highlights the need for adaptive and

contextually aware leadership practices that can navigate the complexities of the educational landscape across different cultural and geopolitical settings.

METHODOLOGY

The research design employed for this study intricately weaves together qualitative and quantitative strands to form a robust mixed-method approach. This design is meticulously tailored to address the multifaceted nature of leadership practices within educational NGOs across Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan, offering a comprehensive exploration of the challenges and opportunities inherent in such diverse settings. The mixed-method approach, encompassing interviews, survey tools, observations, and standardized assessments, serves as a pivotal framework for capturing the nuanced dimensions of NGO leadership. This methodology, aligned with the comprehensive toolset utilized by the CSO Lead programme, underscores the intricate interplay of factors influencing effective leadership within NGOs. By integrating the Actor's Capacity Questionnaire and Leadership Self-Assessment, the study ensures consistency and relevance in data collection, echoing the necessity of in-depth qualitative data highlighted by Santos et al. (2018) for understanding leadership dynamics. Direct observations provided insights into the leadership strategies and internal workings of the NGOs, resonating with the qualitative assessment methods advocated by Taylor, Wills, and Hoadley (2019) for evaluating leadership practices in complex settings. This hands-on approach mirrors the CSO Lead programme's evaluative technique, emphasizing direct interaction to gain a deeper understanding of the relationships and processes within each organization. Employing the Index Rubric of the CSO Lead programme as a foundational tool for assessing leadership qualities further solidifies the alignment between the research methodology and the programme's standards for leadership evaluation. This alignment is crucial for ensuring the study's findings are both relevant and applicable, thereby enhancing the understanding of effective leadership strategies within educational NGOs. The thematic analysis, bolstered by the CSO Lead programme's Index Assessment Report and Evaluation Methodology, provided a structured foundation for analyzing leadership actions. This mixed-methods approach, advocated by Bennett et al. (2019), enriched the research by offering a consistent basis for evaluating leadership approaches, ensuring the study's findings contribute meaningfully to the programme's objectives. In summary, the research design's mixed-method approach is integral to dissecting the complex landscape of NGO leadership, ensuring a thorough exploration of the dynamic interplay between leadership practices and organizational outcomes. This methodology not only aligns with the CSO Lead programme's evaluative standards but also amplifies the study's significance, offering insightful

perspectives on effective leadership within educational NGOs.

The methodology for data collection was designed to be multifaceted, incorporating interviews, surveys, observations, and standardized assessment tools. This comprehensive approach was chosen to capture the complex dynamics of leadership practices within educational NGOs across Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan, ensuring a rich and nuanced understanding of the leadership landscape. Interviews served as a primary source of qualitative data, providing in-depth insights into the experiences, perceptions, and challenges of individuals in leadership positions within the NGOs. The choice to include interviews was based on their ability to yield detailed narratives and personal accounts that could reveal the subtleties and complexities of leadership practices that survey data alone might not capture (Taylor, Wills, & Hoadley, 2019). Surveys complemented the interviews by offering a quantitative measure of leadership practices, attitudes, and outcomes across a larger sample. This method allowed for the collection of standardized data that could be analyzed to identify patterns, trends, and correlations within and across the different contexts of the NGOs studied. Observations provided direct insights into the leadership practices in action, enabling the researchers to witness firsthand the dynamics within the NGOs. This approach allowed for the validation and triangulation of data collected through interviews and surveys, enhancing the reliability and depth of the findings. Standardized assessment tools, specifically developed by the NAMA Foundation, were utilized to ensure a consistent framework for evaluating leadership practices across different contexts. These tools enabled the comparison of leadership qualities and skills against a set benchmark, facilitating a structured analysis of leadership effectiveness within the NGOs. The combination of these data collection strategies was underpinned by a mixed-methods approach, which recognized that effective leadership in NGOs is influenced by a complex interplay of factors. Such an approach aligns with Majee et al.'s (2018) and Santos et al.'s (2018) emphasis on the necessity of in-depth qualitative data to comprehend leadership dynamics, alongside quantitative measures to ascertain broader patterns and impacts.

Following the comprehensive data collection process, the study transitioned into a meticulous phase of data analysis, placing a significant emphasis on qualitative techniques to thematize the responses gathered from interviews, surveys, and observations. This analytical stage was crucial for interpreting the rich, multifaceted insights into leadership practices within the educational NGOs in Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan. The qualitative data, primarily derived from interviews and observations, underwent a rigorous process of thematic analysis. This involved carefully coding the data to identify recurring patterns, themes, and concepts related to leadership practices, challenges, and opportunities within the NGOs. The coding process was guided by both deductive and

inductive approaches: initially drawing from the predefined research questions and theoretical framework, and subsequently allowing for new themes to emerge from the data itself. This dual approach ensured a comprehensive exploration of the data, capturing both anticipated and unexpected dimensions of leadership within the NGO context. To thematize the responses, the study employed a systematic method of data organization, where coded data were aggregated into broader themes that reflected the core aspects of leadership practices and their implications on organizational effectiveness and educational endeavors. This thematic organization facilitated a nuanced understanding of leadership dynamics, revealing the interplay between different leadership styles, organizational culture, and the external environment in shaping the effectiveness of educational NGOs. Furthermore, the study utilized qualitative content analysis to delve deeper into the thematic content, examining the underlying meanings, implications, and contexts of the identified themes. This analysis was instrumental in interpreting the complex narratives and perspectives captured through the qualitative data, enabling the researchers to construct a cohesive narrative around leadership practices in the educational NGOs. To ensure the reliability and validity of the thematic analysis, the study adhered to established qualitative research principles, such as triangulation of data sources, investigator triangulation, and member checking. Triangulation involved cross-verifying the themes across different data sources (interviews, surveys, observations) and analytical perspectives, enhancing the credibility of the findings. Investigator triangulation, which entailed multiple researchers independently analyzing the data, served to mitigate individual biases and corroborate the interpretation of themes. Lastly, member checking involved sharing the thematic findings with some of the participants, seeking their feedback to ensure the accuracy and authenticity of the interpretation. This rigorous analytical process illuminated the multifaceted challenges and opportunities in leadership practices across the educational NGOs, providing valuable insights into the ways in which leadership influences organizational outcomes and the efficacy of educational endeavors. The findings from this qualitative analysis contribute significantly to the existing body of knowledge on NGO leadership, offering strategic implications for leadership development and organizational effectiveness in the context of global education.

FINDINGS

CSO Lead Programme

In the nuanced exploration of leadership practices within educational NGOs across Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan, the CSO Lead Programme emerges as a pivotal initiative by the NAMA Foundation, designed to elevate the leadership capabilities within these critical institutions. This program stands out for its targeted approach towards

enhancing leadership competencies essential for driving organizational and educational advancements within Civil Society Organizations (CSOs). The CSO Lead Programme was strategically developed to address key organizational needs, drawing upon an extensive baseline report to customize its framework and objectives. Its goal was to enrich leadership support, governance, management, human capital awareness, and CSO capacity building—elements foundational to the sustainable growth and effectiveness of CSOs. This initiative's multifaceted aim reflects a profound understanding of the challenges and opportunities inherent in leading educational NGOs, resonating with the empirical insights gleaned from the study's findings. Central to the programme's design was the "Train The Trainers" module, a crucial component that equipped facilitators with the tools and knowledge necessary for catalyzing substantial organizational and individual growth. These facilitators, in turn, played a key role in disseminating these insights, empowering CSO leaders and employees through development programs and coaching sessions. This approach not only facilitated personal development but also contributed to the strategic and action plan development, thereby setting a clear direction for the CSOs' future endeavors. The programme's achievements in bolstering leadership support within CSOs mark a significant milestone towards realizing its objectives. Strategic interventions led to an enhanced quality of leadership support across participating organizations, a critical step towards fostering a conducive environment for organizational development. Moreover, tangible improvements in governance, management practices, and human capital development underscore the programme's effectiveness in meeting its prescribed standards and objectives.

Evaluation of the CSO Lead Programme's impact through a series of indicators revealed significant advancements in governance, management, and supportive leadership, among others. These indicators, including governance and management practices meeting set standards (C1), enhanced supportive leadership (C2), and the availability of qualified and skilled staff through grants (C3), highlight the programme's comprehensive approach to leadership enhancement. Furthermore, the increased awareness of human capital requirements (C4) and the progress in capacity building (C5) demonstrate the substantial strides made in fortifying the organizational learning culture and its implementation measures. In summation, the CSO Lead Programme has underscored its efficacy in nurturing leadership capacities essential for the sustainable growth and operational excellence of CSOs. By emphasizing leadership support, governance, human capital, and capacity building, the programme lays a robust foundation for the participating organizations' future. Its success aligns with the overarching goals of the NAMA Foundation, significantly contributing to the discourse on educational NGO leadership and offering a blueprint for future leadership

development initiatives within the sector. Through this initiative, the CSO Lead Programme exemplifies the transformative potential of targeted leadership enhancement in addressing the multifaceted challenges of global education.

CSO Lead in Indonesia

In the subsequent phase of the study, attention shifts to the empirical data emanating from three Indonesian Civil Society Organizations (CSOs): CSO A, CSO B, and CSO C. Over the years 2021 and 2022, these entities underwent significant scrutiny, their performances evaluated across several domains including governance, leadership, human capital, financial management, and sustainability. The following synthesis endeavors to encapsulate the evolution observed within these organizations, drawing from their annual reports to paint a comprehensive picture of their developmental trajectory.

CSO A

CSO A demonstrated a marked improvement from 2021 to 2022, with its overall average score ascending from 1.8 to 2.3. This uptick was mirrored in almost all domains, notably in governance and supportive leadership where a concerted effort to establish clear operational responsibilities and promote open communication was observed. However, the realm of human capital emerged as a domain necessitating significant enhancement, with recommendations pointing towards the establishment of clear standards for employee performance and the introduction of an internal mentoring framework to bolster morale.

CSO B

CSO B showcased a consistent upward movement, with its average score elevating from 1.9 in 2021 to 2.4 in 2022. The improvements were particularly striking in governance and the quality of supportive leadership, underscoring the organization's commitment to establishing a robust structure and fostering a conducive environment for staff development. Despite these advancements, challenges persisted, particularly in delineating clear roles, operational plans, and regulatory frameworks. The organization was encouraged to fortify its governance structure, enhance human capital management, and amplify financial transparency.

CSO C

CSO C's journey reflected a narrative of gradual but steady progress, with its overall score inching from 1.6 in 2021 to 1.8 in 2022. The organization made strides in promoting open communication and staff training, though it grappled with challenges in documenting operational plans and establishing robust stakeholder relationships. Significant improvements

were urged in identifying employee competency criteria, systemizing performance evaluations, and enhancing financial transparency to foster a sustainable financial model.

A cross-sectional analysis of these CSOs reveals a collective trajectory towards improvement, albeit at varying paces and with distinct focal points. Governance and supportive leadership emerged as common areas of strength, reflecting a sector-wide emphasis on creating transparent, communicative, and supportive organizational cultures. Conversely, human capital management and financial sustainability presented recurring challenges, highlighting a sector-wide need for more structured approaches to staff development, performance evaluation, and financial management. Despite these variances, a unifying theme of commitment to enhancement pervades, with each organization manifesting a willingness to address its shortcomings and build on its strengths. This adaptive approach is emblematic of the Indonesian CSO sector's resilience and determination to evolve in alignment with best practices, ultimately aiming to bolster their contribution to the nation's socio-economic development. In synthesizing these developments, it becomes evident that while progress is palpable, it is uneven. The insights gleaned from the empirical data underscore the importance of tailored interventions that address the unique needs and challenges of each CSO. Moreover, they emphasize the critical role of continuous assessment and feedback mechanisms in guiding these organizations towards more effective, efficient, and impactful operations. This narrative not only enriches the existing discourse on leadership within educational NGOs but also offers valuable lessons for similar organizations grappling with the complexities of growth and development in dynamic environments.

CSO Lead in Tanzania

The examination of empirical data from Tanzania, involving three Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) over the course of 2021 and 2022, offers a rich tapestry of insights into the evolving landscape of nonprofit operational and strategic approaches within the country. The CSOs in focus—CSO D, CSO E, and CSO F—reveal a trajectory of development and areas ripe for further improvement.

CSO D

CSO D witnessed a gradual improvement in its overall average score, moving from 1.6 in 2021 to 2.2 in 2022. The organization demonstrated commendable attempts in establishing a structured role and responsibility framework and promoting transparency. Despite these advancements, there remains significant room for enhancement, particularly in financial management and sustainability. Recommendations for CSO D include devising alternative sources of income and improving mechanisms for competency evaluation and employee appraisals.

CSO E

CSO E showcased a notable progression, with its overall average increasing from 1.8 in 2021 to 2.3 in 2022. The Trust's efforts in creating a conducive work environment through transparency and open communication were highlighted. However, the organization faces challenges in human capital and financial management. Suggested improvements involve establishing a more structured framework for operations, including clear competency standards, evaluation mechanisms, and staff training, alongside formulating a sustainable financial plan.

CSO F

CSO F reported an incremental improvement in its performance, from an overall average of 1.7 in 2021 to 1.9 in 2022. The Foundation was lauded for its inclusive environment and strides toward financial sustainability. However, it is encouraged to promote greater operational transparency and to devise a detailed framework encompassing organizational goals, operational mechanisms, and competency standards. Enhancements in financial management practices and diversification of income sources were also recommended to bolster the Foundation's sustainability.

An overarching theme across the three Tanzanian CSOs is the concerted effort towards better governance, transparency, and the establishment of a solid organizational structure. Each entity has demonstrated a clear commitment to improvement, albeit at varying degrees and with distinct focus areas. Notably, financial management and sustainability emerge as common challenges, underscoring the need for innovative approaches to funding and revenue generation. Additionally, the emphasis on human capital development, through better competency evaluation, staff training, and performance measurement, reflects a sector-wide acknowledgment of the pivotal role of skilled personnel in achieving organizational missions. These insights illuminate the multifaceted journey of Tanzanian CSOs towards enhanced operational efficiency, governance, and sustainability. The gradual improvements observed underscore the resilience and adaptability of these organizations in the face of structural and financial challenges. Furthermore, the detailed recommendations provided offer a roadmap for continued growth, emphasizing the importance of strategic planning, financial acuity, and human capital investment in fostering organizational success and impact. This synthesis not only contributes to the broader discourse on CSO development in Tanzania but also offers actionable strategies for similar entities navigating the complexities of growth and sustainability in a dynamic global landscape.

CSO Lead in Kyrgyzstan

The empirical data from Kyrgyzstan, collected from three Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) across 2021 and 2022, unveils a nuanced landscape of developmental trajectories, challenges, and areas of improvement within these entities. The organizations under scrutiny include CSO G, CSO H, and CSO I. An analysis of their annual reports reveals their respective journeys toward enhancing their organizational capacities, governance structures, financial management, and overall impact.

CSO G

Over the observed period, CSO G exhibited an upward trend in performance, with its overall average score rising from 2.5 in 2021 to 2.6 in 2022. Notably, the organization showed significant strengths in engagement and impact, alongside governance and human capital, indicating a focused effort on developing a robust governance structure and fostering a conducive environment for staff development. However, the CSO was advised to further clarify leadership competencies and distribute authority more evenly across the organization to enhance operational efficiency.

CSO H

CSO H demonstrated a stable performance with an overall average of 2.2 across both years. The organization was commended for its structural organization, transparency, and collective decision-making practices. Despite these strengths, recommendations were made to improve documentation of operational plans and procedures and to lay out clear competency expectations, training plans, and appraisal mechanisms for employees. Enhancing financial sustainability was also marked as an area needing urgent attention.

CSO I

CSO I presented the most pressing need for development, with its overall scores marginally increasing from 1.4 in 2021 to 1.5 in 2022. Despite demonstrating good intentions and basic operational understanding, the organization faced significant challenges in almost all domains, especially in financial management and sustainability. The need for a clearer framework outlining goals, tasks, operational and financial plans, and measurement mechanisms was emphasized to steer the CSO towards a more structured and effective operation.

Across the board, these Kyrgyzstani CSOs share common areas of strength in governance and supportive leadership, indicative of an overarching emphasis on creating transparent, inclusive, and supportive organizational cultures. However, each entity faces unique challenges,

particularly in the domains of financial sustainability and human capital management. These challenges highlight a sector-wide need for more structured approaches to financial planning, staff development, performance evaluation, and sustainable funding mechanisms. This collective analysis underscores the critical role of tailored interventions and continuous improvement strategies to address the distinct needs and challenges faced by each CSO. Moreover, it emphasizes the importance of robust assessment and feedback mechanisms in guiding these organizations towards improved efficiency, impact, and sustainability. The insights drawn from the empirical data not only contribute to the existing discourse on NGO leadership and management within Kyrgyzstan but also offer valuable lessons and strategies for similar entities navigating the complexities of organizational development in dynamic and resource-constrained environments.

DISCUSSION

In synthesizing the empirical findings from the leadership practices within educational NGOs across Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan, this discussion delves into how these practices relate to broader themes of educational leadership and the implications thereof. The exploration, grounded in the theoretical underpinnings of transformational, situational, and servant leadership theories, seeks to draw connections between observed leadership dynamics within the NGOs and their organizational outcomes, as well as the efficacy of their educational endeavors.

The study's findings illuminate the critical role of leadership in navigating the complex landscape of global education, underscoring the pivotal influence of leadership practices on the effectiveness and sustainability of educational NGOs. Across Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan, leadership challenges were multifaceted, ranging from adapting to cultural nuances and navigating governance structures to fostering human capital development and ensuring financial sustainability. These challenges underscore the necessity for adaptive and innovative leadership approaches, aligning with the principles of transformational and situational leadership theories which advocate for leaders' adaptability to varying contexts and their ability to inspire and motivate towards common goals (Bass, 1985; Hersey & Blanchard, 1969). Simultaneously, the opportunities for leadership enhancement identified across these regions—such as the potential for more inclusive, adaptive, and strategic leadership practices—reflect the essence of servant leadership, which emphasizes the importance of meeting the needs of others and empowering communities (Greenleaf, 1977). This convergence of theoretical and empirical insights suggests that effective leadership within educational NGOs is not a one-size-fits-all paradigm but rather a dynamic interplay of various leadership styles tailored to specific

organizational, cultural, and geopolitical contexts. The comparative analysis across the three countries revealed that while leadership practices and their challenges varied, common themes emerged, such as the need for greater emphasis on financial management and sustainability, human capital development, and strategic planning. These findings resonate with the literature on educational leadership, which highlights the importance of strategic leadership in fostering organizational resilience and enhancing educational initiatives (Ehrlich, 2022; Gali & Schechter, 2020).

The study's implications extend beyond the immediate context of the NGOs examined, offering insights into the broader discourse on educational leadership in diverse settings. Firstly, the findings advocate for a nuanced, context-aware approach to leadership development within educational NGOs, emphasizing the importance of understanding and responding to the unique challenges and opportunities within each context. This aligns with calls within the literature for leadership practices that are not only transformative and adaptive but also grounded in the ethos of service and community empowerment (James, Connolly, & Hawkins, 2020). Furthermore, the study highlights the potential for leadership development programmes, such as the CSO Lead programme, to significantly impact organizational outcomes and the efficacy of educational endeavors. By focusing on the development of leadership competencies that align with the identified needs and challenges, such programmes can contribute to the enhancement of educational NGOs' capacity to act as change agents in the education sector. In conclusion, this discussion underscores the critical role of leadership in shaping the effectiveness and sustainability of educational NGOs across diverse contexts. The insights garnered from this analysis not only contribute to the academic understanding of NGO leadership practices but also offer practical implications for enhancing leadership within the sector, advocating for a more adaptive, nuanced, and service-oriented leadership model.

Link to NAMA's Projects

The intricate connection between Civil Society Organization (CSO) leadership and educational activities, particularly within the ambit of NAMA Foundation's projects, underscores a foundational aspect of educational NGOs' operational and strategic efficacy. The findings from the leadership practices within educational NGOs in Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan elucidate the pivotal role of leadership in driving the success of educational activities. This section aims to explore this linkage, delving into the implications of CSO leadership on educational endeavors. The analysis underscores the leadership's critical role within educational NGOs in navigating the complex challenges and leveraging the unique opportunities within their respective operational contexts. For instance,

the leadership challenges encountered in adapting to rapid socio-economic changes in Indonesia or navigating governance and financial sustainability issues in Kyrgyzstan highlight the multifaceted nature of leadership responsibilities (Mujiburrahman, 2016; UNESCO, 2018). Simultaneously, these challenges present unique opportunities for leadership enhancement, such as the potential for innovative educational strategies in Indonesia or leveraging community engagement in Kyrgyzstan.

These findings align with the objectives of NAMA Foundation's CSO Lead programme, which seeks to bolster the leadership competencies of educational NGOs. By enhancing leadership capabilities, the programme aims to augment organizational outcomes and the efficacy of educational initiatives (Ehrlich, 2022; James, Connolly, & Hawkins, 2020). The leadership practices observed in the NGOs across the three countries—ranging from adaptive and innovative approaches to governance and human capital development—embody the core principles advocated by the CSO Lead programme. The connection between CSO leadership and educational activities is further exemplified in the projects undertaken by the NAMA Foundation. The Foundation's focus on educational empowerment through leadership development is premised on the understanding that effective leadership is instrumental in enhancing educational quality and access. This is particularly relevant in contexts like Tanzania, where leadership development is crucial in addressing educational disparities in under-resourced areas (Komba, 2019). The success of educational initiatives, therefore, is intricately linked to the quality of leadership within the CSOs. Effective leadership practices, as evidenced by the study's findings, have a direct impact on the design, implementation, and sustainability of educational projects. For instance, leadership's role in strategic planning, stakeholder engagement, and resource mobilization directly influences the scope, relevance, and impact of educational programmes.

The study's findings hold significant implications for NAMA Foundation's projects and the broader educational NGO sector. First, the insights into the leadership challenges and opportunities within these NGOs provide a roadmap for tailored leadership development programmes. Such programmes, aligned with the ethos of the CSO Lead programme, can foster leadership that is both adaptive to the contextual challenges and strategic in leveraging opportunities for educational advancement. Furthermore, the study reinforces the importance of leadership in not only managing the internal dynamics of NGOs but also in interfacing with the broader educational ecosystem. Effective leadership practices are pivotal in advocating for educational policy changes, mobilizing community support, and fostering partnerships that enhance educational outcomes. In conclusion, the interplay between CSO leadership and educational activities within the ambit of NAMA

Foundation's projects highlights the foundational role of leadership in enhancing educational endeavours. The study's insights into the leadership practices across educational NGOs in Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan underscore the necessity for a nuanced, context-aware approach to leadership development, advocating for a leadership model that is adaptable, inclusive, and strategic in navigating the complexities of global education challenges.

The data presented in Table 4 provides an insightful comparison of total marks, shedding light on the changes in participants' improved writing quality. Twenty-three participants exhibited a clear improvement in their writing performance after using the TAZ Burger in their writing process. Seven participants (A003, A006, A021, A020, A004, A014, and A015) showcased remarkable advancements, with score increments ranging from five to ten marks. Meanwhile, two participants consistently maintained the scores, as exemplified by A011 and A012, scoring nine and fourteen marks in both WT1 and WT2. In contrast, only two participants demonstrated a decline in performance in WT2 compared to WT1. The observed score improvements underscore the positive influence of using TAZ Burger as a supportive tool for writing instruction, leading to enhanced overall writing performance in descriptive essays.

On the other hand, the comprehensive examination of writing scripts of WT1 and WT2 revealed insightful findings about the participants' writing abilities. It was observed that nearly all participants who had initially struggled to compose complete essays in WT1 showed noticeable improvements in their writing quality after using TAZ Burger. This was evidenced by the increased length of their essays, which encompassed both partially completed and fully finished essays. Furthermore, the enhancement of writing quality was consistently achieved across all four aspects: content, communicative achievement, organisation and language.

Theoretical and Practical Implications

In the dynamic and multifaceted realm of educational Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs), the leadership practices and their consequent impacts on organizational outcomes and educational endeavors in Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan offer a rich tableau for both theoretical exploration and practical application. This study has embarked on a nuanced examination of leadership within these NGOs, revealing a complex interplay of challenges and opportunities that both align with and expand upon existing leadership theories while simultaneously offering grounded insights for enhancing leadership effectiveness in practice. The findings of this investigation resonate with the Transformational Leadership theory (Burns, 1978; Bass, 1985), highlighting how leaders within these NGOs inspire and mobilize towards collective goals, despite the diverse socio-cultural and geopolitical landscapes. This echoes the

theoretical premise that transformational leadership's focus on vision, inspiration, and challenging the status quo is crucial in environments marked by rapid change and uncertainty. The adaptability and context-sensitive leadership observed align with the Situational Leadership theory (Hersey & Blanchard, 1969), which posits the significance of tailoring leadership styles to the maturity levels of followers and situational demands. In the varied contexts of Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan, the leaders' ability to navigate cultural nuances, governance structures, and resource limitations exemplifies the practical embodiment of situational leadership principles. Furthermore, the emphasis on serving and empowering communities, a hallmark of Servant Leadership (Greenleaf, 1977), was prominently reflected in the leadership practices of educational NGOs across the study's focal countries. This approach, centered on meeting the needs of others, fostering community development, and promoting collective well-being, underscores the intrinsic values that drive NGO leadership and aligns with the ethos of educational NGOs committed to mitigating educational disparities and enhancing quality education access.

On a practical level, the study's insights into the challenges and opportunities within NGO leadership practices offer actionable strategies for enhancing leadership development initiatives. The nuanced understanding of leadership dynamics derived from this research supports the design of tailored leadership programmes under initiatives like the CSO Lead programme by the NAMA Foundation. These programmes can emphasize the development of adaptive, transformative, and servant leadership qualities, specifically catered to the unique needs and contexts of educational NGOs operating in diverse environments. This research not only contributes to the academic discourse on NGO leadership, providing empirical evidence that enriches the theoretical understanding of leadership dynamics within the non-profit sector but also serves as a strategic resource for practitioners and policymakers. By linking leadership practices to organizational outcomes and educational impact, the study offers a foundation for developing leadership capacities that can navigate the complexities of the educational landscape, ultimately fostering sustainable development and educational equity. In essence, this investigation melds theoretical insights with practical applications, presenting a comprehensive view of NGO leadership that transcends conventional paradigms. It advocates for a nuanced, contextualized approach to leadership development, emphasizing the critical role of leadership in achieving educational NGOs' mission of fostering equitable access to quality education and mitigating educational disparities across the globe.

CONCLUSION

Summary of Findings

This investigation delves deeply into the leadership dynamics of educational Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) across the diverse landscapes of Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan, uncovering the intricate web of challenges and opportunities that shape leadership practices within these entities. The study has illuminated how effective leadership is crucial in steering these organizations through the complexities of global education, emphasizing the need for leaders to be adaptable, innovative, and acutely aware of their socio-cultural and geopolitical environments. The research reveals that leadership within educational NGOs transcends conventional practices, necessitating a blend of adaptability to rapid socio-economic shifts, innovative approaches to cater to diverse educational needs, and a deep contextual sensitivity to harness the unique opportunities presented by each region's distinct socio-cultural fabric. These findings resonate with established leadership theories such as Transformational Leadership, which posits leaders as catalysts of change inspiring collective efforts towards shared goals; Situational Leadership, emphasizing the adaptation of leadership styles to the maturity of the followers and the context at hand; and Servant Leadership, focusing on the prioritization of serving the community's needs above all else.

The significance of this study extends beyond its contribution to theoretical discourse, offering practical implications for leadership development within the educational NGO sector. By identifying specific leadership challenges and opportunities within the NGOs of Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan, the research highlights the necessity for leadership development programmes that are tailored to the nuanced demands of each context. These programmes, sensitive to the unique cultural, economic, and social landscapes, can pave the way for more effective educational initiatives capable of addressing the disparities in global education. Furthermore, the insights garnered from this investigation hold the potential to guide policy-making, strategic planning, and capacity-building efforts aimed at reinforcing the leadership capabilities of educational NGOs. By enhancing leadership effectiveness, these organizations can better fulfil their mission of mitigating educational disparities and fostering sustainable development across the globe. In essence, this study advocates for a nuanced approach to leadership within educational NGOs, championing a model that is both transformative and deeply rooted in the principles of service and community empowerment. Through a detailed exploration of empirical data and theoretical frameworks, the research not only enriches our understanding of NGO leadership practices but also underscores the critical role of leadership in enhancing the impact and efficacy of educational initiatives. It calls for a leadership paradigm that is adaptable, inclusive, and strategic, capable of

navigating the multifaceted challenges of the educational landscape while fostering equitable access to quality education worldwide.

Limitations

Given the depth and scope of this study on the leadership practices at educational NGOs in Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan, several limitations must be acknowledged to contextualize the findings and guide future research. These constraints encompass methodological choices, the breadth of geographic and cultural coverage, and the inherent challenges in capturing the dynamism of leadership practices within diverse socio-cultural and geopolitical settings. Firstly, the reliance on qualitative data, while providing rich, in-depth insights, limits the ability to generalize findings across all educational NGOs within the study regions. The nuanced understanding garnered from interviews, surveys, and observations offers valuable perspectives on leadership practices but may not fully represent the broader array of leadership dynamics prevalent in other NGOs outside the sample. Furthermore, the qualitative analysis, though rigorous, is subject to interpretive biases, underscoring the importance of approaching the findings with an understanding of their contextual nature.

Secondly, the study's geographic scope, focusing on three distinct countries, presents both a strength and a limitation. While it allows for a comparative analysis across diverse contexts, the selection of NGOs within these countries may not capture the full spectrum of leadership practices across the educational NGO sector in each region. This limitation points to the need for caution in extrapolating the findings to all NGOs operating within these countries, as leadership dynamics may vary significantly across different organizations and contexts. Additionally, the leadership practices and challenges identified in this study are deeply influenced by the socio-cultural and political contexts of Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan. As such, the applicability of the findings to NGOs operating in other contexts may be limited, emphasizing the need for context-sensitive approaches to understanding and enhancing leadership in educational NGOs globally. Moreover, the study's focus on leadership practices as they relate to the operational and educational outcomes of NGOs, while comprehensive, does not fully explore the potential influence of external factors, such as policy changes, funding dynamics, and global educational trends, on leadership practices and challenges. This highlights an area for further research, suggesting the need for a broader examination of the external environment's impact on NGO leadership. In sum, while this study contributes significantly to our understanding of leadership practices within educational NGOs in Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan, these limitations underscore the necessity for ongoing research. Future studies should aim to expand the geographic and organizational scope, incorporate a wider range of data

sources, and explore the interplay between external factors and leadership practices to build upon the foundational insights provided here.

Recommendations for Future Research

Building upon the significant insights and findings from this study on the leadership practices within educational NGOs in Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan, it becomes imperative to chart the path for future research. The complexities and nuances of leadership dynamics observed across these varied socio-cultural and geopolitical contexts present fertile ground for further investigation. To extend the discourse on educational NGO leadership and enhance the practical application of leadership development initiatives, this study outlines several recommendations for future research directions. Future investigations should delve deeper into the relationship between specific leadership styles and educational outcomes within NGOs. While this study highlights the overarching impact of adaptive, innovative, and context-sensitive leadership practices, a focused examination of how different leadership styles directly influence educational programmes' effectiveness and sustainability would provide valuable insights. Research could explore, for instance, the comparative effectiveness of transformational versus servant leadership models in achieving educational goals in varied NGO contexts.

Additionally, there is a compelling need to explore the impact of external factors on NGO leadership practices. Factors such as political instability, economic constraints, and socio-cultural norms significantly shape the operational landscape of educational NGOs. Future research could systematically assess how these external pressures influence leadership decision-making, strategy development, and organizational resilience. This line of inquiry would offer a more holistic understanding of the challenges and opportunities facing educational NGO leadership in navigating complex external environments. The role of technology in enhancing leadership within educational NGOs also warrants further exploration. As digital technologies continue to evolve, examining how educational NGO leaders can leverage these tools to improve organizational efficiency, stakeholder engagement, and educational delivery could uncover new avenues for leadership enhancement. Future studies could investigate best practices for integrating technology into leadership strategies and the potential barriers to technology adoption within NGOs. Moreover, the impact of cultural diversity on leadership practices within educational NGOs presents an intriguing area for further study. Given the diverse cultural contexts of Indonesia, Tanzania, and Kyrgyzstan, research into how cultural values and norms influence leadership approaches and effectiveness could enrich our understanding of context-sensitive leadership. This could involve comparative studies across NGOs operating in culturally diverse settings to identify culturally competent leadership practices that facilitate effective educational

initiatives. Lastly, longitudinal studies on the development and evolution of leadership within educational NGOs could provide invaluable insights into the long-term impact of leadership practices on organizational and educational outcomes. Such research could track the progress of leadership development initiatives over time, assessing their sustained impact on enhancing educational access and quality.

REFERENCES

Bass, B. M. (1985). *Leadership and performance beyond expectations*. Free Press.

Bennett, J., Hanley, P., Abrahams, I., Elliott, L., & Turkenburg-van Diepen, M. (2019). Mixed methods, mixed outcomes? Combining an RCT and case studies to research the impact of a training programme for primary school science teachers. *International Journal of Science Education,* 41(4), 490-509.

Berkovich, I., & Foldes, J. V. (2012). Third sector involvement in public education: The Israeli case. *Journal of Educational Administration,* 50(2), 173-187.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77-101.

Burns, J. M. (1978). *Leadership.* Harper & Row.

Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Sage Publications.

Dashtbayaz, M. L., Salehi, M., Mirzaei, A., & Nazaridavaji, H. (2020). The impact of corporate governance on intellectual capitals efficiency in Iran. *International Journal of Islamic and Middle Eastern Finance and Management*, 13, 749-766.

Ehrhart, M. G., Torres, E. M., Green, A., Trott, E., Willging, C., Moullin, J., & Aarons, G. A. (2018). Leading for the long haul: a mixed-method evaluation of the Sustainment Leadership Scale (SLS). *Implementation Science*: IS, 13.

Ehrlich, V. A. F. (2022). *Leadership development as a lever for social change: An evaluation framework and impact storytelling approach*.

Eyal, O., & Yarm, M. (2018). Schools in cross-sector alliances: What do schools seek in partnerships? *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 54(4), 648-688.

Gali, Y., & Schechter, C. (2020). NGO involvement in education policy: principals' voices. *International Journal of Educational Management*, 34, 1509-1525.

Greenleaf, R. K. (1977*). Servant leadership: A journey into the nature of legitimate power and greatness*. Paulist Press.

Hallinger, P. (2018). Bringing context out of the shadows of leadership. *Educational Management Administration & Leadership*, 46, 24-25.

Hersey, P., & Blanchard, K. H. (1969). Life cycle theory of leadership. *Training & Development Journal*.

James, C., Connolly, M., & Hawkins, M. (2020). Reconceptualising and redefining educational leadership practice. *International Journal of Leadership in Education*, 23(6), 618-635.

Kolleck, N. (2018). The power of third sector organizations in public education. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 57(4), 411–425. https://doi.org/10.1108/JEA-08-2018-0142

Komba, W. (2019). The challenges of realizing inclusive education in Tanzania. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 23(4), 393-408.

Majee, W., Reed Adams, J., Goodman, L., Sethi, T. K., & Anakwe, A. (2018). Why are we not winning? An exploration of causes for continued disengagement among graduates of low-income community leadership development programmes. *Community Development,* 49(1), 83-100.

Mujiburrahman, M. (2016). Challenges of Islamic education in Indonesia. In M. Arweck & J. Keenan (Eds.), *Young people, education, and Islam* (pp. 111-128). Springer.

Nowell, L. S., Norris, J. M., White, D. E., & Moules, N. J. (2017). Thematic analysis: Striving to meet the trustworthiness criteria. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 16(1), 1609406917733847.

Özdemir, G., & Şahin, S. (2020). Teachers' self-efficacy perceptions in terms of school principal's instructional leadership behaviours. *International Journal of Progressive Education*.

Santos, J. L. G., dos De Pin, S. B., Guanilo, M. E. E., Balsanelli, A. P., Erdmann, A. L., & Ross, R. (2018). Nursing leadership and quality of care in a hospital setting: mixed methods research. *Northeast Network Nursing Journal*, 19.

Taylor, N., Wills, G., & Hoadley, U. (2019). Addressing the 'leadership conundrum' through a mixed methods study of school leadership for literacy. *Research in Comparative and International Education*, 14(1), 30-53.

UNESCO. (2018*). Education in Kyrgyzstan: Achievements and Challenges*. Retrieved from http://uis.unesco.org/en/country/kg

Yemini, M., Cegla, A., & Sagie, N. (2018). A comparative case-study of school-LEA-NGO interactions across different socio-economic strata in Israel. *Journal of Education Policy*, 33(2), 243-261.

Zaidi, S., Wei, Z., Gedikli, A., Zafar, M. W., Hou, F., & Iftikhar, Y. (2019). The impact of globalization, natural resources abundance, and human capital on financial development: Evidence from thirty-one OECD countries. *Resources Policy*, 64